APPENDIX G

POLICE AND COMMUNITY FEEDBACK
ORGANIZATIONS INTERESTED IN FURTHER COLLABORATION WITH THE NEW YORK CITY POLICE DEPARTMENT

The following organizations have expressed an interest in collaborating with the New York City Police Department to further reform efforts through development and participation in community council meetings, public safety partnerships, community programming, officer training and evaluation, and crisis intervention efforts.

1. Advocates for Children of New York (AFC)
2. CB12M’s Youth and Education Committee
3. Center for NuLeadership on Urban Solutions
4. D6 Community Education Council
5. East Flatbush Village, Inc.
6. El Puente
7. FUREE (Families United for Racial and Economic Equality)
8. Lead by Example/Reverse the Trend, Inc.
9. New York City Anti-Violence Project
10. Rock Safe Streets
11. SCO Family of Services
12. The Central Family Life Center
13. Theatre of the Oppressed NYC
14. True 2 Life
15. Life Camp, Inc.
16. Man Up, Inc.!
17. Osborne Association
18. Fortune Society
19. Make the Road NY
JOINT REMEDIAL PROCESS RECOMMENDATIONS

Collated Reforms from JRP Phases - Draft

Trauma and Restorative Justice

Throughout the Joint Remedial Process, we met with many individuals who had been impacted both directly, and indirectly, by NYPD’S controversial enforcement policies. Whether the individuals themselves had personally experienced a stop encounter, what was evident was a general sense of trauma and mistrust of the department. While the efforts at reform on the part of the department are noteworthy, it is necessary to acknowledge the pervasive mistrust of law enforcement which contributes to a diminished sense of police legitimacy and public safety. During both the police and community focus groups, the community forums, and the leadership meetings the mistrust and trauma were frequent topics of discussion. As such, community members, in some cases officers, proposed the following reforms to the police department.

Recommendations for Reform

1. NYPD should seek to implement Restorative Justice initiatives around healing, reconciliation, and mediation of complaints and disputes between community members and officers.
   a. Utilized in lieu of command disciplines for substantiated CCRB complaints regarding minor conduct infractions
   b. Command officers present at Community Board Meetings where larger community complaints may be addressed with the assistance of a civilian facilitator

2. NYPD should implement trauma-informed law enforcement training to be conducted every 3 years at a minimum.
   a. Training should minimally cover how to recognize the signs and symptoms of trauma, the context of flight, factors and legacy effects of trauma, and psychological first aid.
   b. Training programs should include social service representatives, public health researchers, and practitioners.
   c. Development of a trauma-informed program should require not only knowledge acquisition and behavioral modification, but also cultural and organizational paradigm shifts, and ultimately policy and procedural change at every level of the department.
3. NYPD should implement new or greater policies on harassment and targeting, particularly in the context of vulnerable populations, like LGBTQ, Immigrant, youth and formerly incarcerated individuals.
   a. NYPD should place greater emphasis on vulnerable populations to be incorporated into existing training curricula.
4. NYPD should implement mandatory decompression for officers after traumatic events to circumvent implications for police hypervigilance and overly aggressive responses to situations.
5. To address issues of officer trauma and disillusionment, NYPD should implement annual PTSD screenings for early identification and intervention.
   a. NYPD should implement a trigger system for mental health stressor, aligned with the collateral consequences of officer trauma, as an addendum to the EIS.
   b. Supervisors should be trained to identify mental health stressors in officers, and to direct them to appropriate services.
   c. NYPD should offer support groups for officers who exhibit signs or symptoms of post-traumatic stress and/or disassociation.

Procedural Justice

Procedural justice has become an increasingly popular model for designing interventions to the department that are civically minded. In 21st Century Policing Task Force, under the administration of former President Obama, procedural justice was outlined on four central principles: dignity and respect, giving voice to civilians, neutrality and transparency and conveyance of trustworthy motives. Over the course of the Joint Remedial Process, community members cited their encounter with officers as the most critical element of a legitimate stop. During the focus groups and forums alike, community members made several suggestions for ways in which the department can improve their procedures and protocols for stop encounters and trespass enforcement. Many of the communities represented at the forums and other phases highlighted a need for community-specific protocols to policing. Generally, they felt the department should have a greater understanding of these populations and design policies and practices that do a better job of addressing the unique concerns of each community.

Recommendations for Reform

1. Recognizing the need for fundamental human dignity, NYPD should create specific training and/or reinforce current training on respectful conduct. Officers should be trained to approach civilians in a consistently polite and respectful manner.
a. Including how to articulate demands in a firm and respectful tone without coercion, and emphasizing the officer's civic duty to engage civilians with courtesy, professionalism, and respect.

2. Officers should clearly identify themselves at all levels of encounters.
   a. Greet civilian with name and badge number
   b. Offer civilian a business card
   c. Name, badge number, and precinct information should be provided at all levels

3. Officers should provide a stop receipt, or equivalent record after every stop\(^1\).

4. NYPD should implement policy measures and protocols ensuring that frisk procedures for women and transgender persons be done appropriately and with discretion\(^2\).

5. In stops conducted on the grounds that a subject “fit the description,” officers should allow civilians to hear the radio-run to legitimize the reason for the stop.

6. NYPD should implement regulatory policies on the cultivation of confidential informants.
   a. Officers should be prohibited from targeting or harassment of young people for the purposes of cultivating informants
   b. Officers should be prohibited from use of electronic devices for profiling of informants without their express permission

7. With respect to level 2 consent searches, NYPD should implement requirements for some form of record or report.

8. Regarding consent searches, officers should be trained to answer as completely as possible, questions from individuals they engage at any level.

9. NYPD should create and a precinct drop box for civilian complaints, suggestions, and reports. Community members have suggested these boxes be placed across the city near libraries, and other public buildings, to increase access.

10. NYPD should develop an app or website for gathering police encounter data, to get a stronger sense of the number and type of stops taking place.
   a. This could look like a web-based system for anonymous reporting of stop/encounters, provide location and name/badge number of the officer
   b. This app should be managed in partnership with community organizations to track trends to which the Commanding Officer is held accountable

---

\(^1\) Community members overwhelmingly suggested that the officers provide community members with some form of a record of their encounter. NYPD has launched a new stop receipt, however many community members had not, and still have not, seen it. It is unclear whether it is because of the perceived reduction in the number of stops, or if officers are just not handing them out. There is a need for more consistent implementation of the stop receipt.

\(^2\) Young women expressed a general concern about being frisked by male officers. Transgender women expressed a concern that frisking is conducted in a way that does not challenge their gender identity or trigger a sense of being sexually harassed or assaulted.
11. NYPD should implement procedural justice protocols in housing patrols, including the following ideas for implementation:
   a. Officers should be escorted by a resident during vertical patrols.
   b. Officers should be required to substantiate suspicion of trespass by confirming with the visited resident.
   c. NYPD should strictly prohibit officers from driving on sidewalks in housing developments, particularly near common spaces (i.e., basketball courts, playgrounds, etc.)
   d. NYPD should implement consistent patrol officers and greater partnership efforts with tenant associations and residences.
   e. The development tenant association should, in partnership with the commanding officer, have the discretion to bar offending officers\(^3\) from working on the development’s premises.

12. NYPD should implement procedural justice protocols specific to vulnerable populations like LGBTQ, immigrant, youth, at-risk and those with special needs.
   a. There should be a strict policy on misgendering, condescension and coercive language used toward transgender individuals.
   b. NYPD should strive for language access, when possible, for interactions with non-English speakers.
   c. Protocols for engaging youth should include a clear articulation of events and parent notification.

**Police-Community Relations**

Our research in the form of focus groups, qualitative data analysis, community forums and leadership meetings has shown that, although the amount of stops has decreased significantly from the height of 684,000 recorded stops in 2011, the residual effects of SQF policy in directly-affected communities are still palpable some six years later. These effects include great mistrust and fear of the NYPD by many law-abiding citizens; a reluctance by many community members to seek the assistance of the NYPD even in instances where insufficient police intervention could be life-threatening. While it is the case that the widespread use and abuse of the legitimate policing tool of stop, question, and frisk and trespass enforcement has contributed to the deep ambivalence towards the NYPD that exists in some communities throughout the City, it is also the case that the overwhelming majority of the citizens resident in these communities who in one form or another participated in the JRP wanted better communication with the Department and its officers and more importantly wanted better policing, greater understanding, and engagement

\(^3\) Offending officers being those who are charged with repeatedly harassing and/or abusing residents.
by the NYPD with their communities. While acknowledging the department's efforts at
reforming the policy and culture of the department, many groups highlighted a need for the
department to conduct broader outreach efforts, including via social media, newspapers,
television and other media outlets. Doing so, they've suggested, would give the community a
greater sense of awareness of not only the changes to the department but opportunities for
civilians to get involved at the local level. Several special interest groups provided suggestions
for the department to partner with organizations who have the relevant expertise in working with
these groups to develop protocols and procedures to assist the department in addressing these
areas with best practices. Below is a list of the collected suggestions:

Recommendations for Reform

1. NYPD should implement specific protocols for community engagement, broadly, and
   more specifically the following:
   a. NYPD should implement a pilot program for COs to meet with affected
      community members to inform, review and problem-solve in collaboration with
      community stakeholders.
      i. NYPD should reinvigorate its current community council meetings to be
         more inclusive of a broader audience of community members.
      ii. Meetings should be co-facilitated with social service organizations.
      iii. NYPD meetings should engage youth in “safe spaces” or utilize a youth
           delegate.

   b. NYPD precincts should implement partnership and collaboration campaigns with
      CBOs and other Community Stakeholders.
      i. These groups should be utilized as a resource in the development and
         evaluation of training materials.
      ii. These groups should also be utilized as a public safety task force

   c. Cadet and New Officer should be required to participate in service-learning
      activities, volunteering with community organizations that serve those in need.
      i. Presentations with local leaders

   d. NYPD should develop an initiative to foster precinct-level relationships with the
      local community.

   e. NYPD should engage in responsive policing practices that put the needs of their
      local communities at the forefront of impact strategy.

   f. NYPD should implement consistent patrols, sector cops, and NCOs, particularly
      in public housing

2. NYPD should take steps to expand the department’s community investment
a. NYPD should reinvigorate Police Athletic League programs, and additional mentoring programs, particularly in those communities most directly impacted by street encounters, as well as in public housing.

3. NYPD should implement a campaign for community education, highlighting the rights and responsibilities of New York City civilians
   a. Programs should be run in schools, community centers, etc., in collaboration with and lead by credible community stakeholders
   b. Programs should include resident training in public housing
   c. NYPD should implement a workshop pilot program as soon as possible.

4. NYPD should implement a public relations campaign to inform civilians of the changes to the department. This campaign should include:
   a. Presentation of current reforms
   b. Humanization of officers
   c. Acknowledgment of department missteps
   d. Expanded outreach to marginalized communities

5. NYPD should implement a Community Policing Policy Model, and or expand the current NCO program.

6. NYPD should implement strategies to assess officer engagement in performance evaluation
   a. Engagement should be linked to promotional opportunities
   b. Engagement metrics should include superiors and commanding officers
   c. Community leaders should have input into the development of engagement metrics.

Training and Evaluation

Throughout the varying phases of the JRP, training, and evaluation were often cited areas for recommended reform. Community members pointed to the need for greater balance between traditional training components and community-centered focus on public safety. Both community members and officers who participated in the Joint Remedial Process stressed a greater need for repetition in training, as well as training on how to better engage community members. Groups generally highlighted the importance of repetition and retraining officers on current policies and practices for constitutional policing. In focus groups with police, line officers and executives, alike, emphasized the need for broader and more frequent quality training for officers and supervisors to ensure they are implementing best practices for
encounters with community members and other areas of law enforcement. Activists called more time and consistency in implementation of training programs.

While the police academy has made tremendous strides with the inclusion of training on implicit bias and procedural justice, community members still felt the department could benefit from several additional competency areas:

**Recommendations for Reform**

1. Expand In-Service training, regularly increase frequency, significant time given to firearms training, but need more for community engagement and conduct, enhancements, conducted in collaboration with and run by community-based organizations.
   a. NYPD should implement minimum in-service training requirements, which a police officer must satisfactorily complete every 3 years. Those requirements should include topics like constitutional policing and proper use of law enforcement authority, cultural competency, procedural justice, history and civil rights, and trauma-informed training.
   b. NYPD should implement minimum in-service training requirements, which a police officer must satisfactorily complete at least annually. Those requirements should include law updates, implicit bias, de-escalation and use of force training which should include scenario-based training.

2. NYPD should implement academy and in-service training on diversity and cultural competency developed in collaboration with and run by community-based organizations.
   a. As an addendum, and concerning these trainings, NYPD should make a commitment to organizational cultural competency audits, policy development, and improved leadership understanding of cultural competence, to foster an organizational culture responsive to the needs of diverse communities.

3. NYPD should implement human rights training programs on specialized populations [including emotionally-disturbed individuals, those with special needs, LGBTQ populations, non-native English speakers, et. al.] run in collaboration with community-based organizations.
   a. NYPD should take measures to ensure it is providing adequate resources and supports for officers to work with specialized groups.

4. NYPD should implement training on customer service and de-escalation developed in collaboration with and run by community-based organizations. Training should place a strong emphasis on tactics, and instructions on how to properly intervene in situations.
   a. Should be incorporated into in-service training and utilize both lecture-style and scenario-based instruction methods.
b. As a supplement, and to assist with training development and identification of officers, NYPD should review use of force trends and literature to identify officers most in need of training for intervention.

5. NYPD should implement historical training, developed in collaboration with community-based organizations and city agencies, on the history and context of policing, major law enforcement litigation, people's movement, as well as current and former policy of the department.
   a. These training would ideally be developed by a practicing clinician and co-facilitated at the academy.

6. NYPD should implement training on youth development and effective engagement strategies for working with minors
   a. Providing opportunities to interact with youth positively, and deemphasizing the use of intimidation during encounters.

7. NYPD should reassess and redesign its present field training structure
   a. Field training should be run by experienced officers, in collaboration with community stakeholders and/or organizations, prior to formal policing assignment.
   b. Field training should include a service-learning component wherein probationary officers volunteer in communities before they begin patrolling.
   c. At a minimum, field training should be conducted annually for an officer's first 3 years of service.

8. NYPD should implement training programs for precinct leadership which discuss management best practices for management and implications for officers on the street.

9. NYPD should implement evaluations of training outcomes and effectiveness

10. Community Engagement Metrics for Performance Evaluations
    a. NYPD should include a performance dimension on officers’ communication skills
    b. NYPD should include a performance dimension on the level of empathy in officers’ interactions
    c. NYPD should utilize social media commendations in officer evaluations. This could include ‘Likes’ on officer profiles which may factor into evaluation and/or be credited toward an officer's career points.
    d. NYPD should otherwise acknowledge or reward good officers annually.

11. NYPD should implement precinct-level evaluations by community
    a. Evaluations should take the form of a precinct survey or "temperature check" of community satisfaction/concerns with their precinct.
    b. Community leaders should have input into the development of precinct evaluations
Accountability and Oversight

One of the most notable suggestions from the community throughout the JRP was the stressed need for greater responsibility and accountability for precincts and commanders in the NYPD. During the different phases many people cited the desire for a relationship with their local departments, but a lack of trust in a department that "doesn't hold its officers accountable." Many groups highlighted the vague and seemingly arbitrary measures taken in the department presently. In the focus groups and community forums alike, there was a call for a "three-strike" rule of accountability, escalating the level of discipline for officers with repeated violations. Groups also highlighted greater accountability for supervisors in properly assessing disciplinary needs. Advocates and organization leaders highlighted the need for a more strategic organization on the part of the department to assess and design interventions around some prevalent issues in policing, particularly for the sake of accountability, and in resolving its fractured relationship with the public. Groups made several suggestions for changes to the department:

Recommendations for Reform

1. Suggested specifications for Body-Worn Camera Program caveat that NYPD should publish the report findings, as well as a basis for adoption or non-adoption of suggestions
   a. Video recording at all level of encounters
   b. Footage should be preserved based on the level of encounter, and/or allegations of misconduct.
   c. Footage should be used for accountability and not accusations
   d. Officers involved in a complaint must provide a written affidavit of the encounter in question before they can review footage.
   e. Civilians should be made aware of, and have the discretion to decide when the camera is on or off.
   f. For the purposes of litigation, attorneys should have access to footage upon request.

2. NYPD should incorporate tools for accountability by geographic unit. These tools could take several forms and increase awareness for officers and civilians on public safety and community needs in local areas. Such tools could be:
   a. Annual Survey
   b. Precinct Grading System
   c. Accountability for Commanding Officers based on Public Survey
3. NYPD should implement a Feedback Loop System and Early Warning System for the identification, and intervention, of officer misconduct. The feedback look should include, but not be limited to:
   a. Reports from criminal courts
   b. Reporting and assessment of declinations of prosecution
   c. CCRB substantiated
   d. Command Discipline
   e. Civilian Complaints
   f. Evaluation Process
   g. Accountability Matrix
   h. Further, develop EIS
   i. Development or expansion of data trend analysis by risk assessment or QAD

4. NYPD should implement a civilian Report impact analysis, storing and reviewing trends for strategic development.
   a. Connect web/app to NYPD database to track and account for unreported stops
   b. Incorporate precinct boxes throughout the city.
   c. As it pertains to unreported/underreported stops, there needs to be an accurate picture of police encounters. NYPD should focus on 3 objectives: development of responsive analysis and procedures to evaluate effectiveness of SQF and trespass enforcement policy, training needs, public transparency and accountability with community and officials
      i. Identify the support needs of officers
         1. Supervisory scaffolding
         2. Follow-up and re-instruction
      ii. NYPD should tailor reporting to meet the needs of officers (e.g., time to fill out and submit reports)
      iii. NYPD should incorporate more extensive methods of engaging PBA to gain buy-in from officer groups.
      iv. NYPD should work more closely nonprofits and oversight entities to conduct analyses of department policy and trends.
         1. NYCLU stop app
         2. CCRB training
      v. App and audit
      vi. Department Analytics

5. Randomized Integrity Tests
   a. NYPD should implement randomized integrity tests to identify issues with stop reporting, focusing on less punitive, and more behavior modification

10
6. Progressive Discipline
   a. NYPD should implement a progressive discipline model with a sliding scale of disciplinary interventions for violations of department policy
   b. At minimum, individual precincts should implement disciplinary structures that implement progressively harsher penalties for repeated infractions, beginning first with instructional interventions and escalating toward stricter command disciplines.
   c. The department should also develop a strict matrix for imposing discipline for egregious violations like excessive use of force and un
   d. Guidelines used in review of substantiated findings

7. NYPD emphasize greater accountabilities for supervisors in monitoring officers conduct and areas for improvement.
   a. Patrol
   b. Special units

8. NYPD should collaborate with an independent oversight committee comprised representatives from directly impacted communities and police reform organizations to review and create metrics on NYPD's compliance with constitutional law.
   a. Resident Oversight Board with NYCHA Tenant Associations should have the power to make recommendations to local precincts on officer fitness
   b. LGBTQ Oversight Committee should have the power to review and make recommendations to local precincts regarding issues of LGBT complaints of abuse, misgendering, allegations of survival sex work, etc.
   c. CCRB should conduct training on civilian oversight

Transparency and Transitional Justice

In the focus groups, leadership meetings, and community forums, respectively, community members called for greater transparency in the department with regard to discipline, policy, and limitations of the department. NYPD is an insular institution whose reform efforts often elude even the most proactive officer and the most vigilant civilians. While officers called for greater transparency and clearer messaging from headquarters, civilians called for greater transparency more globally; this includes for accountability, policy, research and legitimacy. Community members highlighted a need for public acknowledgment on the part of the department with regard to its mistakes, and officers highlighted a need to reinforce the transformations taking place within the department.
Recommendations for Reform

1. Design and publish a publicly accessible database of officers, including their badge number and precinct.
2. Access to Stop Reports, accessible database
3. Complaint Follow-up within the department
   a. Complaint database
4. Promote the Encounter App, keep a public record of encounters
5. Body-Worn Camera footage accessible upon request
6. Truth and Reconciliation, NYPD should adopt a nuanced view of accountability and responsibility, focused on a balanced approach to restoring police legitimacy
   a. NYPD Commissioner should issue a public acknowledgment to the community about mistakes and efforts toward reconciliation.

Areas for Policy Consideration

During the Joint Remedial Process, the team received several suggestions that, while outside of the scope of the Remedial reform process, we felt warranted additional consideration from the department, policy makers, legislators, and researchers alike. It is our sincerest belief that with a focused analysis of community needs, these ideas can be pushed forward through fierce advocacy both at the local and state level. We’ve highlighted many of those suggestions below.

Recommendations for Reform

1. Mayor’s Office of the City of New York
   a. The Mayor’s office and the State of New York should re-evaluate their interpretation of state law 50A, which prohibits the department from sharing information which has historically been open to the public.
      i. Many groups agree the current interpretation of 50A is overbroad, and therefore, poorly governed by the City.
   b. Alternative Policing Strategy
      i. The City should reallocate funding to provide additional grant-funding to local organizations for providing programs in restorative justice, crisis intervention, mental health, local democracy, community patrols/task forces, decriminalization, housing, and homelessness prevention
      ii. In collaboration with city agencies, [HRA, DOB, DOE, DHS, Admin Svs, DOP, ACS, DYCD, DJJ, MOCJ, ADA, Law Dept.] NYPD should implement divergence protocols to social services agencies better equipped to address underlying community issues.
1. E.g. diversion for domestic incidents to social service agencies that work with battered women or anger management

   iii. The process should consist of identifying and prioritizing community issues, analyzing and designing intervention procedures, and implementing evaluation of effectiveness.

   iv. Meetings with law enforcement, social service agencies and community boards on a monthly basis to develop training, and procedures to ensuring more efficient use of city services.

   v. Collaboratively, all parties are part of the identification, implementation, and resolution process. City agencies, particularly grant-funding, should defer services to community-based organizations with the skills and discipline to provide the necessary resources.

   vi. Develop a civilian department at the NYPD to process diversions, reviewing social history and identifying needs, utilizing officers to gather additional intelligence and improve regulation.

2. CCRB

   a. CCRB should collaborate with NYPD to develop a mutually [acceptable] disciplinary system for substantiated complaints.

   b. CCRB should develop, in collaboration with the NYPD Department Advocate's Office, formal procedures for timely follow-up on civilian complaints filed with the agency.

      i. At minimum, follow-ups should include the status of the complaint, the outcome, and an explanation of the basis for decisions, if necessary. These updates can be disseminated via email, text or standard mail.

   c. CCRB should develop a publicly accessible database of complaints about tracking and development of

   d. CCRB should implement an officer disposition metric in the investigation of complaints of force, abuse of authority, discourtesy or offensive language.

   e. CCRB staff should be trained in complaint mediation and integrate efforts into interventions for substantiated complaints.

3. NYCHA

   a. NYCHA should implement police partnership efforts, charging the department to collaborate with the local tenant associations to develop clear and consistent guidelines for the enforcement of house rules, problem-solving and intervention.

   b. NYCHA should extend community center hours in public housing development to mitigate the need for police encounters with youth.
c. NYCHA should review and revise its current practices and policies for increasing public safety
   i. NYCHA should limit the use of NYPD light towers, work with the Department of Transportation to ensure developments have working streetlights.
   ii. NYCHA should remove scaffolding on properties where there is no construction
   iii. NYCHA should ensure that all installed cameras are in working order, and utilize tenant patrols to assist in the review of footage.

d. NYCHA should recruit from the community members from developments to conduct building security
   i. NYCHA should incentivize tenant patrols for youth, offering stipends for monitoring and securing facilities.
   ii. Community doing vertical patrols, empowerment, responsibility

4. NYPD

   a. There is a great need for organizational cultural change within the Department
   b. NYPD should review and enlist in the National Initiative for Building Community Trust and Justice
      i. Resources available for departments committed to bridging gaps and rebuilding legitimacy
      ii. NYPD should sign up as a pilot site
   c. NYPD should be decentralized, and individual precinct structures streamlined to assist in the development of responsive models of policing.
   d. Responsibility for private building owners entering into the affidavit program
      i. NYPD, in collaboration with the Department of Buildings, should implement screening protocols for the trespass affidavit program. Building registrants should be provided a probationary affidavit to be reviewed after the initial enrollment period.
      ii. Re-enrollment contingent upon the building owner filing and completing application for inspection and repairs with the Department of Buildings.
          1. DOB expedite compliance inspections for TAP
      iii. Department could utilize Sector or Neighborhood Coordination officers to conduct an initial assessment and report to DOB, to determine security issues which need to address in advance of TAP renewal.
   e. NYPD should develop a diversity initiative which reflects the demographics of the community.
i. Recruitment efforts should include for middle management positions like deputy inspectors, inspectors, assistant chiefs and so on.