

# GIBBONS, DEL DEO, DOLAN, GRIFFINGER & VECCHIONE

A PROFESSIONAL CORPORATION

GIBBONS FELLOWSHIP IN  
PUBLIC INTEREST & CONSTITUTIONAL LAW

JOHN J. GIBBONS  
SENIOR PARTNER

ATTORNEYS AT LAW  
ONE RIVERFRONT PLAZA  
NEWARK, N.J. 07102-5496

973-596-4500

WEB SITE  
<http://www.gibbonslaw.com>

LAWRENCE S. LUSTBERG  
DIRECTOR

SHAVAR D. JEFFRIES  
DEPUTY DIRECTOR

PHILIP G. GALLAGHER  
JENNIFER CHING  
JONATHAN L. HAFETZ\*  
GITANJALI S. GUTIERREZ

\* NOT ADMITTED IN N.J.

May 25, 2004

## VIA FACSIMILE AND OVERNIGHT DELIVERY

Robert T. Herman  
Information and Privacy Coordinator  
Central Intelligence Agency  
Washington, D.C. 20505

### Re: Freedom on Information Act Request

Dear Mr. Herman:

This letter constitutes a request for records pursuant to the Freedom of Information Act ("FOIA"), 5 U.S.C. § 552 *et seq.*, and corresponding regulations. The request is submitted on behalf of the following organizations (collectively, "Requesters"): American Civil Liberties Union ("ACLU"), Center for Constitutional Rights ("CCR"), Physicians for Human Rights ("PHR"), Veterans for Commons Sense ("VCS") and Veterans for Peace ("VFP").

#### **1. Records Sought**

Requesters seek records concerning the treatment of individuals apprehended after September 11, 2001, and held in United States custody in military bases or detention facilities outside the United States ("Detainees"). Over the past months, it has become clear that many Detainees have been subjected to illegal interrogation, physical abuse, and even torture at the hands of United States personnel. In order to shed light on the policies and practices of the United States government with respect to Detainees, Requesters seek the following records:

- a) Records concerning the treatment of Detainees in United States custody;
- b) Records concerning the deaths of Detainees in United States custody; and
- c) Records related to the rendition of Detainees and other individuals to foreign powers known to employ torture or illegal interrogation techniques.

Robert T. Herman  
May 25, 2004  
Page 2

To assist you in your search for records, Requesters have attached an appendix listing some of the records that fall within the scope of this request. See Appendix A. The list is meant only to provide guidance and is not exhaustive.

As you know, Requesters previously sought records from the Central Intelligence Agency ("Agency") relating to the treatment of Detainees through a FOIA request filed on October 7, 2003 ("First Request").<sup>1</sup> The instant request seeks, in addition to all of the records sought by the First Request, records that may have been generated or obtained since October 7, 2003.

## 2. Requesters Are Entitled To Expedited Processing.

Expedited processing is warranted where there is a "compelling need" by organizations "primarily engaged in disseminating information and the information [requested] is relevant to the subject of public urgency concerning an actual or alleged Federal Government activity." 32 C.F.R. § 1900.34(c), (c)(2). Each of the Requesters is "primarily engaged in disseminating information," see Appendix C (description of Requesters' media and publication activities), and the records in question involve the Department's actual and alleged treatment of Detainees. In addition, the records sought relate to a breaking news story of general public interest; accordingly, the records are "relevant to a subject of public urgency" within the meaning of applicable regulations. 32 C.F.R. § 1900.34(c)(2). The instant request clearly meets these standards. See, e.g., Douglas Jehl and Eric Schmitt, *CIA Bid to Keep Some Detainees Off Abu Ghraib Roll Worries Officials*, NYTimes.Com, May 25, 2004; John Barry et al., *The Roots of Torture: The Road to Abu Ghraib Began After 9/11, When Washington Wrote New Rules to Fight a New Kind of War*, Newsweek.com, May 24, 2004 (tracing news coverage uncovering abuse of Detainees in Iraq and Afghanistan); Douglas Jehl and Eric Shmitt, *Dogs and Other Harsh Tactics Linked to Military Intelligence*, NYTimes.com, May 22, 2004; Scott Higham, et al., *Prison Visits By General Reported in Hearing*, WashingtonPost.com, May 23, 2004; Bradley Graham, *Number of Army Probes of Detainee Deaths Rises to 33*, WashingtonPost.com, May 22, 2004; Douglas Jehl and Eric Schmitt, *Afghan Policies On Questioning Taken to Iraq: Harsher Interrogation Practices are Cited*, NYTimes.com, May 21, 2004; David Rose and Gaby Hinsliff, *U.S. Guards 'Filmed Beatings' at Terror Camp*, Observer.Guardian.uk.com, May 16, 2004 (British military interrogator posted to Abu Ghraib "made an official complaint to U.S. authorities" regarding the maltreatment of Detainees "as long ago as last March"); R. Jeffrey Smith, *Knowledge of Abusive Tactics May Go Higher*, WashingtonPost.com, May 16, 2004; Charlie Savage, *As Threats to U.S. Changed, So Did Prison Tactics*, BostonGlobe.com, May 16, 2004 (military whistleblower turned in photographs of abuse of prisoners to officials in Abu Ghraib in January, 2004); Douglas Jehl, *Earlier Jail Seen as Incubator for Abuses in Iraq*, NYTimes.com, May 15, 2004 (International Committee for the Red Cross report citing abuse of

---

<sup>1</sup> The previous request was filed by the Agency under Request No. F-2004-00066.

Robert T. Herman  
May 25, 2004  
Page 3

prisoners submitted to government in February, 2004); Mitch Frank, *A Pattern of Abuse?*, Time.com, May 9, 2004 ("For two years reports have piled up about 'stress and duress' techniques military and CIA officers are using on al-Qaeda and Iraqi captives"); Dana Priest and Joe Stephens, *Pentagon Approved Tougher Interrogations*, WashingtonPost.com, May 9, 2004. See also Appendix A-B (further listing of news articles). In view of these concerns, expedited processing is appropriate in this case. See Appendix B-C.

### 3. Requesters Are Entitled To A Fee Waiver.

Requesters are entitled to a fee waiver because disclosure of the requested records is in the public interest and "likely to contribute significantly to the public understanding of the activities of the government." 5 U.S.C. § 552(a)(4)(A)(iii). As indicated above and in the attached Appendices, innumerable media reports reflect the extraordinary public interest in the records sought. All of the Requesters are not-for-profit organizations and this request is not "primarily in the commercial interest" of any Requester; *id.*; see also Appendix B (description of individual organizations).

Requesters are entitled to a statutory limitation on fees because the records are not sought for commercial use and, as described in the attached appendices, each of the requesters is a "representative of the news media" within the meaning of the statute and relevant regulations. See Appendix C (description of Requesters' media and publication activities). Requesters seek records for purposes of publication and to further non-commercial interests that will significantly contribute to the public understanding of government conduct.

\* \* \* \*


If the request is denied in whole or part, Requesters ask that the Agency justify all deletions by reference to specific exemptions of FOIA. Requesters expect the Agency to release all segregable portions of otherwise exempt material, and reserve the right to appeal a decision to withhold any information or to deny the within applications for expedited processing and waiver of fees.

Thank you for your consideration of this request. Kindly direct all future responses to Jennifer Ching, Gibbons, Del Deo, Dolan, Griffinger & Vecchione, P.C., One Riverfront Plaza, Newark, New Jersey, telephone (973) 596-4721.

Robert T. Herman  
May 25, 2004  
Page 4

Under penalty of perjury, I hereby affirm that the foregoing and attached Appendices are true and correct to the best of my knowledge and belief.

Signed by:



---

Lawrence S. Lustberg  
Jennifer Ching  
**GIBBONS, DEL DEO, DOLAN,  
GRIFFINGER & VECCHIONE**  
A Professional Corporation  
One Riverfront Plaza  
Newark, New Jersey 07102  
(973) 596-4500  
Attorneys for Requesters

Judy Rabinovitz  
Amrit Singh  
Jameel Jaffer  
**AMERICAN CIVIL LIBERTIES UNION  
FOUNDATION**  
125 Broad Street, 18<sup>th</sup> Floor  
New York, New York 10004  
(212) 549-2609

Steven Watt  
Barbara Olshanksy  
Michael Ratner  
**CENTER FOR CONSTITUTIONAL  
RIGHTS**  
666 Broadway, 7<sup>th</sup> Floor  
New York, New York 10012  
(212) 614-6464

Robert T. Herman

May 25, 2004

Page 5

cc: Leonard S. Rubenstein  
Physicians for Human Rights

Wilson Powell  
Veterans for Peace

Charles Sheehan Miles  
Veterans for Common Sense