

IN THE UNITED STATES COURT OF APPEALS
FOR THE ARMED FORCES

----- x
: CENTER FOR CONSTITUTIONAL RIGHTS, :
: GLENN GREENWALD, JEREMY SCAHILL, : Crim. App. Misc.
: THE NATION, AMY GOODMAN, DEMOCRACY : Dkt. No. 20120514
: NOW!, CHASE MADAR, KEVIN GOSZTOLA, :
: JULIAN ASSANGE, and WIKILEAKS, : USCA Misc.
: : Dkt. No. 12-8027/AR
: Appellants, :
: : General Court Martial
v. : *United States v. Manning*,
: : Ft. Meade, Maryland
: :
: UNITED STATES OF AMERICA and CHIEF :
: JUDGE COL. DENISE LIND, : Dated: 19 July 2012
: :
: Appellees. :
: :
----- x

CONSENT MOTION TO CORRECT ERRATA

Petitioner-Appellants hereby move (pursuant to Rule 30 of this Court) for leave to correct the following errata in their opening and reply briefs in the above-captioned case:

1. Both the opening brief and reply brief did not include an Index (Table of Contents) or Table of Cases, Statutes and Other Authorities. Along with a cover page, appropriate tables are appended hereto for both briefs.¹

¹ Rule 37 of this Court's Rules of Practice indicates that all pleadings over a certain length should include these tables. Rule 24 contains a template form for briefs in ordinary appeals that includes tables, but Rule 28, containing a form of writs and writ-appeal petitions, does not include tables. Given the ambiguity, Petitioner-Appellants have submitted this Errata.

2. The opening brief, page 4, lines 10-12, contains a typographic error, repeated twice: "in a matter not inconsistent with the First Amendment" should read "in a manner not inconsistent...." each time.

3. The certification of compliance with word limits for the reply brief mistakenly states that the brief is "a principal brief." That should read "a reply brief"; the stated word count is correct and under the applicable word limit for a reply brief.

4. For two cases cited in the reply, at the first citation, a short form cite is mistakenly used in place of a full citation. These are the citation to *Richmond Newspapers v. Virginia*, 448 U.S. 555 (1980) at page 5 of the reply brief and the citation to *Grove Fresh Distributors, Inc. v. Everfresh Juice Co.*, 24 F.3d 893 (7th Cir. 1994) at page 7.

Counsel for Appellees has been consulted and does not object to this motion.

Undersigned counsel apologizes for the errors.

Date: New York, New York
19 July 2012

Respectfully submitted,

 /s/sdk
Shayana D. Kadidal
J. Wells Dixon
Baher Azmy, Legal Director
Michael Ratner, President Emeritus

CENTER FOR CONSTITUTIONAL RIGHTS
666 Broadway, 7th Floor
New York, New York 10012
Tel: (212) 614-6438
Fax: (212) 614-6499

Jonathan Hafetz
169 Hicks Street
Brooklyn, NY 11201
Tel: (917) 355-6896

Counsel for Petitioner-Appellants

Certificate of Service

I hereby certify on this 19th day of July, 2012, I caused the foregoing Motion to Correct Errata to be filed with the Court and served on Respondents electronically via email (per this Court's Electronic Filing Order of 22 July 2010), and to be served on the trial and appellate courts and defense, as listed below, via courier or mail at the following addresses, respectively:

Clerk of the Court
U.S. Court of Appeals for the Armed Forces
450 E Street, NW
Washington, DC 20442-0001
Tel: (202) 761-1448
efiling@armfor.uscourts.gov

- and -

U.S. Army Court of Criminal Appeals
Office of the Clerk of Court
9275 Gunston Road
Fort Belvoir, VA 22060-5546

- and -

Chief Judge Col. Denise Lind
U.S. Army Trial Judiciary, 1st Judicial Cir.
U.S. Army Military District of Washington
Office of the Staff Judge Advocate
103 Third Ave., SW, Ste 100.
Ft. McNair, DC 20319

- and -

David E. Coombs (counsel for Pfc. Manning)
Law Office of David E. Coombs
11 South Angell Street, #317
Providence, RI 02906
Tel: (508) 689-4616
(COURTESY COPY)

- and -

Capt. Judge Advocate Chad M. Fisher
Appellate Government Counsel
Office of the Judge Advocate General
U.S. Army Legal Services Agency
9275 Gunston Rd.
Ft. Belvoir, VA 22060
Tel: (703) 693-0783
chad.m.fisher.mil@mail.mil

/s/sdk

Shayana Kadidal

IN THE UNITED STATES COURT OF APPEALS
FOR THE ARMED FORCES

----- x
: CENTER FOR CONSTITUTIONAL RIGHTS, :
: GLENN GREENWALD, JEREMY SCAHILL, : Crim. App. Misc.
: THE NATION, AMY GOODMAN, DEMOCRACY : Dkt. No. 20120514
: NOW!, CHASE MADAR, KEVIN GOSZTOLA, :
: JULIAN ASSANGE, and WIKILEAKS, :
: Appellants, : General Court Martial
: : United States v. Manning,
: : Ft. Meade, Maryland
: v. :
: :
: Dated: 26 June 2012
: UNITED STATES OF AMERICA and CHIEF :
: JUDGE COL. DENISE LIND, :
: :
: Appellees. :
: :
----- x

**WRIT-APPEAL PETITION FOR REVIEW OF ARMY COURT OF CRIMINAL
APPEALS DECISION ON APPLICATION FOR EXTRAORDINARY RELIEF
AND SUPPORTING MEMORANDUM OF LAW**

Shayana D. Kadidal
J. Wells Dixon
Baher Azmy, Legal Director
Michael Ratner, President Emeritus
CENTER FOR CONSTITUTIONAL RIGHTS
666 Broadway, 7th Floor
New York, New York 10012
Tel: (212) 614-6438
Fax: (212) 614-6499

Jonathan Hafetz
169 Hicks Street
Brooklyn, NY 11201
Tel: (917) 355-6896

Counsel for Petitioner-Appellants

**Index of Brief
(Petitioner-Appellants Opening Brief)**

Preamble.....1

History of the Case.....2

Relief Sought.....3

Issues Presented.....4

Statement of Facts.....5

Reasons Why Writ Should Issue.....8

 I. The Public Has a Presumptive Right to Access
 to Documents in Criminal Proceedings10

 II. Neither the Government Nor the Court Have Identified
 Any Compelling Interest That Would Overcome the Very
 Strong Presumption in Favor of Public Access18

 III. The Trial Court’s Practice of Deciding Substantive
 Issues within R.C.M. 802 Conferences Is Inconsistent
 with the Public’s Right of Access to These Proceedings29

Conclusion.....36

**Table of Cases, Statutes, and Other Authorities
(Petitioner-Appellants Opening Brief)**

Applications of NBC, 828 F.2d 340 (6th Cir. 1987).....11

Ashcraft v. Conoco, Inc.,
218 F.3d 288 (4th Cir. 2000).....19, 20

Assange v. United States, Misc. No. 12-8008/AR,
2012 CAAF LEXIS 42 (C.A.A.F. Jan. 11, 2012).....6, 38-39

Associated Press v. United States Dist. Court,
705 F.2d 1143 (9th Cir. 1983).....11, 17, 25-26

Brown & Williamson Tobacco Corp. v. FTC,
710 F.2d 1165 (6th Cir. 1983).....14

Chicago Tribune Co. v. Ladd (In re AP),
162 F.3d 503 (7th Cir. 1998).....16

Dayton Newspapers, Inc. v. United States Dep't of the Navy,
109 F. Supp. 2d 768 (S.D. Ohio 1999).....22, 29

Denver Post Co. v. United States,
Army Misc. 20041215, 2005 CCA LEXIS 550 (A.C.C.A. 2005).....10

Elrod v. Burns, 427 U.S. 347 (1976).....18, 26

Freedberg v. Department of Navy,
581 F. Supp. 3 (D.D.C. 1982) (Gesell, J.).....29

Gambale v. Deutsche Bank AG,
377 F.3d 133 (2d Cir. 2004).....20

Gannett Co. v. DePasquale, 443 U.S. 368 (1979).....14

Gitto v. Worcester Telegram & Gazette Corp.
(*In re Gitto Global Corp.*), 422 F.3d 1 (1st Cir. 2005).....21

Globe Newspaper Co. v. Pokaski,
868 F.2d 497 (1st Cir. 1989).....11

Globe Newspaper Co. v. Superior Court, 457 U.S. 596 (1982).....14

Grove Fresh Distributors, Inc. v. Everfresh Juice Co.,
24 F.3d 893 (7th Cir. 1994).....16

<i>Hearst Newspapers, L.L.C. v. Cardenas-Guillen</i> , 641 F.3d 168 (5th Cir. 2011).....	11
<i>Huminski v. Corsones</i> , 386 F.3d 116 (2d Cir. 2004), <i>as amended on reh'g</i> , 396 F.3d 53 (2d Cir. 2005).....	15
<i>In re Globe Newspaper Co.</i> , 729 F.2d 47 (1st Cir. 1984).....	11
<i>In re Knight Publishing Co.</i> , 743 F.2d 231 (4th Cir. 1984).....	19
<i>In re Knoxville News-Sentinel Co.</i> , 723 F.2d 470 (6th Cir. 1983).....	21
<i>In re New York Times Co.</i> , 828 F.2d 110 (2d Cir. 1987), <i>cert. denied</i> , 485 U.S. 977 (1988).....	11
<i>In re Oliver</i> , 333 U.S. 257 (1948).....	15
<i>In re Search Warrant for Secretarial Area Outside Office of Gunn</i> , 855 F.2d 569 (8th Cir. 1988).....	11
<i>In re Violation of Rule 28(d)</i> , 635 F.3d 1352 (Fed. Cir. 2011).....	12
<i>In re Wash. Post Co.</i> , 807 F.2d 383 (4th Cir. 1986).....	9-11
<i>Loving v. United States</i> , 64 M.J. 132 (C.A.A.F. 2006).....	13
<i>Lugosch v. Pyramid Co. of Onondaga</i> , 435 F.3d 110 (2d Cir. 2006).....	20
<i>Nebraska Press Ass'n v. Stuart</i> , 427 U.S. 539 (1976).....	18
<i>New York Times v. United States</i> , 403 U.S. 713 (1971).....	13, 18, 26
<i>Nixon v. Warner Commc'ns, Inc.</i> , 435 U.S. 589 (1978).....	10
<i>Oregonian Publ'g Co. v. United States Dist. Court</i> , 920 F.2d 1462 (9th Cir. 1990).....	11
<i>Press-Enter. Co. v. Superior Court [Press-Enterprise I]</i> , 464 U.S. 501 (1984).....	19

<i>Richmond Newspapers, Inc. v. Virginia</i> , 448 U.S. 555 (1980).....	14, 26
<i>Riker v. Federal Bureau of Prisons</i> , 315 Fed. Appx. 752 (10th Cir. 2009) (unpublished opinion).....	12
<i>Stone v. Univ. of Maryland Medical Sys. Corp.</i> , 855 F.2d 178 (4th Cir. 1988).....	20-21
<i>United States v. Adriance</i> , 1988 CMR LEXIS 222 (A.F.C.M.R. Mar. 4, 1988).....	35
<i>United States v. Amodeo</i> , 44 F.3d 141 (2d Cir. 1995).....	13
<i>United States v. Amodeo</i> , 71 F.3d 1044 (2d Cir. 1995).....	13, 20
<i>United States v. Aref</i> , 533 F.3d 72 (2d Cir. 2008).....	18, 36-37
<i>United States v. Criden</i> , 675 F.2d 550 (3d Cir. 1982).....	19
<i>United States v. Denedo</i> , 556 U.S. 904 (2009).....	10
<i>United States v. Desciscio</i> , 22 M.J. 684 (A.F.C.M.R. 1986).....	34, 35
<i>United States v. Dowty</i> , 60 M.J. 163 (C.A.A.F. 2004).....	13
<i>United States v. Garcia</i> , 24 M.J. 518 (A.F.C.M.R. 1987).....	34
<i>United States v. Gonzales</i> , 150 F.3d 1246 (10th Cir. 1998), <i>cert. denied</i> , 525 U.S. 1129 (1999).....	12
<i>United States v. Grey</i> , 1997 CCA LEXIS 198 (N-M.C.C.A. Jun. 20, 1997).....	35
<i>United States v. Grunden</i> , 2 M.J. 116 (C.M.A. 1977).....	27
<i>United States v. Haller</i> , 837 F.2d 84 (2d Cir. 1988).....	11
<i>United States v. Henry</i> , 53 M.J. 108 (C.A.A.F. 2000).....	35
<i>United States v. Hershey</i> , 20 M.J. 433 (C.M.A. 1985).....	19, 23
<i>United States v. Ladd (In re Associated Press)</i> , 162 F.3d 503 (7th Cir. 1998).....	11
<i>United States v. McVeigh</i> , 119 F.3d 806 (10th Cir. 1997).....	11

<i>United States v. Morlan</i> , 24 C.M.R. 390 (A.C.M.R. 1957).....	33
<i>United States v. Nieto</i> , 66 M.J. 146 (C.A.A.F. 2008).....	12
<i>United States v. Ochoa-Vasquez</i> , 428 F.3d 1015 (11th Cir. 2005).....	11
<i>United States v. Ortiz</i> , 66 M.J. 334 (C.A.A.F. 2008).....	25, 27, 30
<i>United States v. Peters</i> , 754 F.2d 753 (7th Cir. 1985).....	11
<i>United States v. Sadler</i> , 29 M.J. 370 (C.M.A. 1990).....	34
<i>United States v. St. Blanc</i> , 70 M.J. 424 (C.A.A.F. 2012).....	13
<i>United States v. Scott</i> , 48 M.J. 663 (Army Ct. Crim. App. 1998), <i>pet'n for rev. denied</i> , 1998 CAAF LEXIS 1459 (C.A.A.F. 1998).....	21-22
<i>United States v. Smalley</i> , 9 Media L. Rep. 1255 (N.D. Tex. 1983).....	16
<i>United States v. Smith</i> , 787 F.2d 111 (3d Cir. 1986).....	11
<i>United States v. Smith</i> , 776 F.2d 1104 (3d Cir. 1985).....	11
<i>United States v. Valente</i> , 6 C.M.R. 476 (C.G.C.M.R. 1952).....	33
<i>United States v. Valigura</i> , 54 M.J. 187 (C.A.A.F. 2000).....	12
<i>United States v. Walker</i> , 66 M.J. 721 (N-M.C.C.A. 2008).....	34-35
<i>United States v. Wecht</i> , 537 F.3d 222 (3d Cir. 2008).....	15
<i>United States v. Whitney</i> , 23 U.S.C.M.A. 48, 48 C.M.R. 519 (1974).....	34
<i>Video Software Dealers Ass'n v. Orion Pictures Corp.</i> , 21 F.3d 24 (2d Cir. 1994).....	18
<i>Washington Post Co. v. Robinson</i> , 935 F.2d 282 (D.C. Cir. 1991).....	10-11, 14

LAW REVIEWS

Eugene R. Fidell, *Accountability, Transparency & Public Confidence in the Administration of Military Justice*, 9 Green Bag 2d 361 (2006).....37

Lt. Col. Denise R. Lind, *Media Rights of Access to Proceedings, Information, and Participants in Military Criminal Cases*, 163 Mil. L. Rev. 1 (2000).....28

MILITARY COURT RULES

R.C.M. 802.....2, 5, 7, 30, 32, 33, 37

R.C.M. 802, Drafters Analysis..... 36

Manual for Courts-Martial, Discussion, R.C.M. 802..... 20

R.C.M. 806.....9

R.C.M. 1103(b) (2) (B).....32-33

A.C.C.A. Rule 20.....3

Courts of Criminal Appeals Rules of Practice and Procedure, Rules 2(b) and 20.....3

C.A.A.F. Rules of Practice and Procedure 13(a-b), 38(b).....38

Regulation for Trial by Military Commission.....26-27

FEDERAL STATUTES

10 U.S.C. § 836(a).....13

28 U.S.C. § 1295.....12

28 U.S.C. § 1651(a).....3

MISCELLANEOUS AUTHORITIES

Declaration of Kevin Gosztola.....8, 17

Declaration of Shayana Kadidal.....2, 4, 7-8, 23-24, 27-29, 38

Declaration of Alexa O'Brien.....7, 31-32

Defense Motion to Record and Transcribe All R.C.M. 802
Conferences (2 June 2012).....31

IN THE UNITED STATES COURT OF APPEALS
FOR THE ARMED FORCES

----- x
:
CENTER FOR CONSTITUTIONAL RIGHTS, :
GLENN GREENWALD, JEREMY SCAHILL, : Crim. App. Misc.
THE NATION, AMY GOODMAN, DEMOCRACY : Dkt. No. 20120514
NOW!, CHASE MADAR, KEVIN GOSZTOLA, :
JULIAN ASSANGE, and WIKILEAKS, : USCA Misc.
: Dkt. No. 12-8027/AR
Appellants, :
: General Court Martial
v. : *United States v. Manning,*
: Ft. Meade, Maryland
:
UNITED STATES OF AMERICA and CHIEF :
JUDGE COL. DENISE LIND, : Dated: 13 July 2012
:
Appellees. :
:
----- x

REPLY BRIEF IN SUPPORT OF
WRIT-APPEAL PETITION FOR REVIEW OF ARMY COURT OF CRIMINAL
APPEALS DECISION ON APPLICATION FOR EXTRAORDINARY RELIEF

Shayana D. Kadidal
J. Wells Dixon
Baher Azmy, Legal Director
Michael Ratner, President Emeritus
CENTER FOR CONSTITUTIONAL RIGHTS
666 Broadway, 7th Floor
New York, New York 10012
Tel: (212) 614-6438
Fax: (212) 614-6499

Jonathan Hafetz
169 Hicks Street
Brooklyn, NY 11201
Tel: (917) 355-6896

Counsel for Petitioner-Appellants

**Index of Brief
(Petitioner-Appellants Reply Brief)**

Argument.....3

 I. Precedent requires a right of *contemporaneous* public
 access3

 II. Cases involving audio and video records are not the
 equivalent of cases seeking documents7

 III. FOIA is no substitute for access under the
 First Amendment12

 IV. The history of public access is irrelevant.....19

 V. R.C.M. 802 conferences are subject to the
 First Amendment right of public access23

Conclusion.....26

**Table of Cases, Statutes and Other Authorities
(Petitioner-Appellants Reply Brief)**

Application of Washington Post, No. 92-301,
1992 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 16882,
1992 WL 233354 (D.D.C. 1992).....13

Dayton Newspapers, Inc. v. United States Dep't of the Navy,
109 F. Supp. 2d 768 (S.D. Ohio 1999).....12, 13, 14

Detroit Free Press v. Ashcroft,
303 F.3d 681 (6th Cir. 2002).....21

Doe v. Gonzales, 500 F. Supp. 2d 379 (S.D.N.Y. 2007),
aff'd in part, rev'd in part on diff. grounds,
549 F.3d 861 (2d Cir. 2008)..... 18

Draper v. Martin, 664 F.3d 1110 (7th Cir. 2011).....20

Freedberg v. Department of Navy,
581 F. Supp. 3 (D.D.C. 1982) (Gesell, J.).....14

Globe Newspaper Co. v. Superior Ct.,
457 U.S. 596 (1982).....20

Globe Newspaper Co. v. Pokaski,
868 F.2d 497 (1st Cir. 1989) (Coffin, J.).....10

Grove Fresh Distribs. v. Everfresh Juice Co.,
24 F.3d 893 (7th Cir. 1994).....7

Hernandez v. Cook Cnty. Sheriff's Off.,
634 F.3d 906 (7th Cir. 2011).....19

Housley v. United States,
1992 U.S. App. LEXIS 26368 (9th Cir. 1992)
(unpublished mem. dec., table report at 978 F.2d 715).....17

In re Associated Press,
172 Fed. Appx. 1, 2006 WL 752044 (2006).....25

In re Applications of NBC,
828 F.2d 340 (6th Cir. 1987)..... 7, 8

In re Oliver, 333 U.S. 257 (1948).....4, 5

Long-Gang Lin v. Holder, 630 F.3d 536 (7th Cir. 2010).....19

<i>McLeod v. DOJ</i> , 2011 WL 2112477 (D.D.C. May 24, 2011).....	17
<i>Nebraska Press Ass'n v. Stuart</i> , 427 U.S. 539 (1976).....	6
<i>Nixon v. Warner Communications</i> , 435 U.S. 589 (1978).....	7, 8, 9
<i>North Jersey Media Group v. Ashcroft</i> , 308 F.3d 198 (3d Cir. 2002).....	20
<i>NYCLU v. NYCTA</i> , 652 F.3d 247 (2d Cir. 2011).....	21
<i>Pickering-George v. Registration Unit</i> , 553 F. Supp. 2d 3 (D.D.C. 2008).....	17
<i>Press-Enterprise Co. v. Superior Court</i> , 478 U.S. 1 (1986).....	20
<i>Richmond Newspapers, Inc. v. Virginia</i> , 448 U.S. 555 (1980).....	5, 25
<i>Strunk v. United States Dep't of State</i> , 693 F. Supp. 2d 112 (D.D.C. 2010).....	17
<i>United States v. Beckham</i> , 789 F.2d 401 (6th Cir. 1986).....	7-11
<i>United States v. Hershey</i> , 20 M.J. 433 (C.M.A. 1985).....	5
<i>United States v. Ortiz</i> , 66 M.J. 334 (C.A.A.F. 2008).....	5
<i>United States v. Berger</i> , 990 F. Supp. 1054 (C.D. Ill. 1998)....	10
<i>United States v. Scott</i> , 48 M.J. 663 (Army Ct. Crim. App. 1998), <i>pet'n for rev. denied</i> , 1998 CAAF LEXIS 1459 (C.A.A.F. 1998).....	13, 18, 20
<i>United States v. Smith</i> , 787 F.2d 111 (3d Cir. 1986).....	24
<i>United States v. Torres-Aguilar</i> , 352 F.3d 934 (5th Cir. 2003).....	20
<i>United States v. Travers</i> , 25 M.J. 61 (C.M.A. 1987).....	20
<i>United States v. Valenti</i> , 987 F.2d 708 (11th Cir. 1993).....	24
<i>United States v. Wecht</i> , 537 F.3d 222 (3d Cir. 2008)).....	7

Waller v. Georgia, 467 U.S. 39 (1984).....4

TREATISES AND MISCELLANEOUS SOURCES

Defense Motion to Record and Transcribe All R.C.M. 802 Conferences.....25

Statement of President Johnson on signing Military Justice Act of 1968, P.L. 90-632 (Oct. 24, 1968).....22

Matthew L. Wald, *Slow Responses Cloud a Window into Washington*, N.Y. Times (Jan. 28, 2012).....16

Alexander Bickel, *The Morality of Consent* (1975).....6

Winthrop's *Military Law and Precedents* (2d ed. 1896) (reprinted 1920)..... 19

Lt. Col. Denise R. Lind, *Media Rights of Access to Proceedings, Information, and Participants in Military Criminal Cases*, 163 Mil. L. Rev. 1 (2000).....16, 26, 27

RULES, ACTS OF CONGRESS, AND STATUTES

E.O. 13,365, 69 Fed. Reg. 71333 (Dec. 3, 2004).....27

Manual for Courts Martial (2012), R.C.M. 806(b)(2), Discussion.23

Army FOIA regulation AR 25-55.....15

Defense Authorization Act 1980, P.L. 96-107, 93 Stat. 811, § 801(b) (Nov. 9, 1979).....22

5 U.S.C. § 551(a)(1)(F).....16

5 U.S.C. § 552(a)(6)(A)(i).....16

R.C.M. 806(b)(2).....21, 23

R.C.M. 802.....passim

R.C.M. § 806(c).....9

5 U.S.C. § 552(b).....13
10 U.S.C. § 836.....21

JOINT APPENDIX MATERIALS

Declaration of Kevin Gosztola.....6
Declaration of Shayana Kadidal.....26
Declaration of Alexa O'Brien.....11